# **PETITION & AM CONCERN**

COMMITTEE DATE: 08/02/2017

APPLICATION No. 16/00711/MJR APPLICATION DATE: 30/03/2016

ED: LLANISHEN

APP: TYPE: Full Planning Permission

APPLICANT: Waterstone Homes Ltd

LOCATION: LAND AT LLANISHEN RUGBY CLUB, USK ROAD,

LLANISHEN, CARDIFF, CF14 0NN

PROPOSAL: DEVELOPMENT OF 25 HOUSES AND ASSOCIATED

**INFRASTRUCTURE** 

**RECOMMENDATION 1**: That, subject to relevant parties agreeing with the Council to provide a 3G floodlit sports pitch and changing rooms at Llanishen Highschool; and subject to relevant parties entering into a binding planning obligation in agreement with the Council under **SECTION 106** of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990, within 6 months of the date of this resolution unless otherwise agreed by the Council in writing, in respect of matters detailed in section 9 of this report, that planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

- 1. C01 Statutory Time Limit
- 2. Permission is granted for the development detailed on drawing references:
  - 2174/100 Rev A Site Plan
  - 2174/101 Rev E Site Layout
  - 2174 205 01 House Type AF 2B
  - 2174 205 02 House Type AF 4P2V, AF5P3B, AF64B
  - 2174 200 01 Rev B House Type A
  - 2174 200 01 Rev A House Type B
  - 2174 202 01 Rev A House Type C
  - 2174 203 01 Rev A House Type D
  - 2174 206 01 Rev A House Type F
  - 2174 207 01 Rev A House Type G
  - 2174 208 01 Garage

Reason: The drawing form part of the application and for the avoidance of doubt.

- The develop shall be finished in accordance with a palette of external finishing materials, samples of which having first been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing.
   Reason: To ensure for an appropriate finished appearance to the development.
- 4. No development shall take place until details of facilities for the storage of refuse containers have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority and the development shall not be put into beneficial use until the approved facilities are provided and thereafter refuse shall only be stored in accordance with the approved details.

Each property will require facilities to accommodate the following recycling and waste containers:

- 1 x 140 litre bin for general waste
- 1 x 25 litre kerbside caddy for food waste
- Green bags for mixed recycling (equivalent to 140 litres)

Reason: To secure an orderly form of development and to protect the amenities of the area.

- 5. No development shall take place until detailed plans showing the position and form of construction of all roads and footpaths within the site and the method of disposal of all surface water drainage therefrom, and final finishes have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
  - Reason: To ensure an orderly form of development and to make provision for the satisfactory access to any dwelling by the future occupants.
- 6. The development shall be provided with a scheme of site enclosure in accordance with details which shall first have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing the means of site enclosure shall be constructed in accordance with the approved details prior to the development being put into beneficial use.
  - Reason: To ensure that the amenities of the area are protected.
- 7. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any Order amending, revoking, or re-enacting that Order) No hard surfaces, buildings, or enclosures, structures, platforms, swimming or other pools, or excavations required for any purpose incidental to the enjoyment of any dwelling house as such, shall be erected, constructed or placed under the canopy spread of any trees located within the Gwern y Bendy woodland which over sale the garden area of the dwelling houses hereby approved without first obtaining planning permission from the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: The Woodland is of Nature Conservation Importance and such otherwise permitted developments may by virtue of design, loading or physical interference with the root structures of trees compromise the health and longevity of the trees which form the woodland.

8. No dwelling shall be occupied until that part of the road and footpath which provides access to it and all surface water drainage works for the said road have been laid out, constructed and completed in accordance with the approved plans.

Reason: To ensure an orderly form of development and to make provision for satisfactory access to the dwelling by the future occupants.

9. Prior to first beneficial occupation of any dwelling, the footpath link from the site to Rheidol Close, shall be provided in accordance with a scheme of detail which shall first have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

Reason: To maintain and improve pedestrian access to the site and linkages with Llanishen train station.

10. Prior to first beneficial occupation of any dwelling, the footpath link from the site to Rhyd y penau park shall be provided in accordance with a scheme of detail which shall first have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

Reason: To maintain and improve pedestrian access to public open space in the locality.

11. Prior to first beneficial occupation, the development and footpath linkages shall be provided with a scheme of lighting, details of which shall first have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

Reason To ensure for a safe and environment.

12. No trees shall be pruned, lopped or felled between the months of March and September unless specifically authorised by the local planning authority Ecologist.

Reason: To ensure that such works would not affect nesting birds.

13. The car parking spaces and garage provision shall be laid out / completed prior to the beneficial occupation of the dwelling houses which they serve and shall thereafter be retained and maintained for the parking of vehicles.

Reason: To allow sufficient provision for the parking of vehicles clear of the highway and to provide appropriate facilities for the safe, covered storage of cycles.

14. Prior to the commencement of development, a construction management plan providing full details of construction traffic routes, contractor parking, delivery protocols, dust suppressions, noise mitigation, wheel washing facilities, site enclosures, site security and other such features as are proposed to minimise interference with, and maintenance of the safe and convenient free flow of traffic along the highway and protection of neighbouring amenity, and addressing fully, recognised site access constraints, shall be submitted to and approved

by the local planning authority in writing.

Reason: To ensure for an orderly form of development with least impact on existing residents in the area.

15. No development shall be commenced until such time as an Arboricultural Method Statement, Tree Protection Plan, and finalised Landscaping Scheme have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The landscaping specification should be informed by a Soil Resource Survey and Plan prepared in accordance with the latest approved DEFRA Code of Practice and Guidance Notes The Landscaping plan shall provide full details of both hard and soft landscape works including proposed finished levels, hard surfacing materials, permeable paving and other permeable surfaces, loose finishes, proposed and existing functional services above and below ground, planting plans (noting schedules of plants, species, plant sizes and proposed numbers/densities) topsoil and subsoil specification. tree pit sections and plan views, planting methodology and aftercare methodology. The aftercare methodology should include details of long-term management for the proposed buffer zones.

These works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details prior to the occupation of any part of the development or in accordance with a programme agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To maintain and improve the appearance of the area and in the interests of visual amenity and to ensure for best practice in respect of tree preservation and landscaping of the site in a manner which will have best potential to secure the establishment and longevity of the scheme.

16. All trees shown for retention shall be preserved and maintained and in the event of any such tree dying, being removed, becoming seriously damaged or diseased within 5 years of the completion of the development a replacement tree of a similar species shall be planted and maintained unless the Local Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason: The trees are of value in the local environment and should be protected and maintained in the interests of visual amenity, development screening and to maintain and enhance opportunity for biodiversity in the immediate area.

- 17. Notwithstanding the approved layout plan, the landscaping proposals shall include for the incorporation of the miscellaneous verges currently shown outside of the boundary walls of properties, to be included within the curtilage boundaries.
  - Reason: To ensure such areas fall within the obvious ownership and responsibility of home owners or tenants.
- 18. No development shall commence until a drainage scheme for the site has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning

authority in writing. The scheme shall provide for the disposal of foul, surface and land water, and include an assessment of the potential to dispose of surface and land water by sustainable means. Thereafter the scheme shall be implemented in full in accordance with the approved details prior to the occupation of the development and no further foul water, surface water and land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage system.

Reason: To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment.

19. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any Order amending, revoking, or re-enacting that Order) no gate, fence, wall or other means of enclosure or access shall be erected, constructed or made along the northern and eastern boundaries of the site with the Gwern y bendy Woodland or Llanishen Reservoir without first obtaining planning permission from the local planning authority.

Reason: The formation of an access or unregulated means of enclosure along those boundaries would likely adversely affect the nature conservation value of adjacent land and visual appearance of the development .

20. In the event that contamination is found at any time when carrying out the approved development that was not previously identified it must be reported in writing within 2 days to the Local Planning Authority, all associated works must stop, and no further development shall take place unless otherwise agreed in writing until a scheme to deal with the contamination found has been approved. An investigation and risk assessment must be undertaken and where remediation is necessary a remediation scheme and verification plan must be prepared and submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme a verification report must be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The timescale for the above actions shall be agreed with the LPA within 2 weeks of the discovery of any unsuspected contamination.

Reason: To ensure that any unacceptable risks from land contamination to the future users of the land, neighbouring land, controlled waters, property and ecological systems are minimised, and to ensure that the development can be carried out safely without unacceptable risks to workers, neighbours and other offsite receptors in accordance with policy EN13 of the Cardiff Local Development Plan.

21. Any topsoil [natural or manufactured], or subsoil, to be imported shall be assessed for chemical or other potential contaminants in accordance with a scheme of investigation which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority in advance of its importation. Only material approved by the Local Planning Authority shall be imported. All measures specified in the approved scheme shall be

undertaken in accordance with the relevant Code of Practice and Guidance Notes.

Subject to approval of the above, sampling of the material received at the development site to verify that the imported soil is free from contamination shall be undertaken in accordance with a scheme and timescale to be agreed in writing by the LPA.

Reason: To ensure that the safety of future occupiers is not prejudiced in accordance with policy EN13 of the Cardiff Local Development Plan.

22. Any aggregate (other than virgin quarry stone) or recycled aggregate material to be imported shall be assessed for chemical or other potential contaminants in accordance with a scheme of investigation which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority in advance of its importation. Only material approved by the Local Planning Authority shall be imported. All measures specified in the approved scheme shall be undertaken in accordance with the relevant Code of Practice and Guidance Notes.

Subject to approval of the above, sampling of the material received at the development site to verify that the imported material is free from contamination shall be undertaken in accordance with a scheme and timescale to be agreed in writing by the LPA.

Reason: To ensure that the safety of future occupiers is not prejudiced in accordance with policy EN13 of the Cardiff Local Development Plan.

23. Any site won material including soils, aggregates, recycled materials shall be assessed for chemical or other potential contaminants in accordance with a sampling scheme which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority in advance of the reuse of site won materials. Only material which meets site specific target values approved by the Local Planning Authority shall be reused.

Reason: To ensure that the safety of future occupiers is not prejudiced in accordance with policy EN13 of the Cardiff Local Development Plan.

**RECOMMENDATION 2**: The contamination assessments and the effects of unstable land are considered on the basis of the best information available to the Planning Authority and are not necessarily exhaustive. The Authority takes due diligence when assessing these impacts, however you are minded that the responsibility for

- (i) determining the extent and effects of such constraints;
- (ii) ensuring that any imported materials (including, topsoils, subsoils, aggregates and recycled or manufactured aggregates/ soils) are chemically suitable for the proposed end use. Under no circumstances should controlled waste be imported. It is an offence under Section 33 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 to deposit controlled waste on a

site which does not benefit from an appropriate waste management license. The following must not be imported to a development site;

- Unprocessed / unsorted demolition wastes.
- Any materials originating from a site confirmed as being contaminated or potentially contaminated by chemical or radioactive substances.
- Japanese Knotweed stems, leaves and rhizome infested soils. In addition to section 33 above, it is also an offence under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 to spread this invasive weed; and
- (iii) the safe development and secure occupancy of the site rests with the developer.

Proposals for areas of possible land instability should take due account of the physical and chemical constraints and may include action on land reclamation or other remedial action to enable beneficial use of unstable land.

The Local Planning Authority has determined the application on the basis of the information available to it, but this does not mean that the land can be considered free from contamination.

**RECOMMENDATION 3**: To protect the amenities of occupiers of other premises in the vicinity attention is drawn to the provisions of Section 60 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974 in relation to the control of noise from demolition and construction activities. Further to this the applicant is advised that no noise audible outside the site boundary adjacent to the curtilage of residential property shall be created by construction activities in respect of the implementation of this consent outside the hours of 0800-1800 hours Mondays to Fridays and 0800 - 1300 hours on Saturdays or at any time on Sunday or public holidays. The applicant is also advised to seek approval for any proposed piling operations.

**RECOMMENDATION 4**: Works to adopted highways would need to be approved by means of section 278/38 agreement as appropriate. The technical specification of the proposed shared surface access road will require detailed consideration.

**RECOMMENDATION 5**: The applicant be advised that they may need to apply to Dwr Cymru / Welsh Water for any connection to the public sewer under S106 of the Water industry Act 1991. If the connection to the public sewer network is either via a lateral drain (i.e. a drain which extends beyond the connecting property boundary) or via a new sewer (i.e. serves more than one property), it is now a mandatory requirement to first enter into a Section 104 Adoption Agreement (Water Industry Act 1991). The design of the sewers and lateral drains must also conform to the Welsh Ministers Standards for Gravity Foul Sewers and Lateral Drains, and conform with the publication "Sewers for Adoption"- 7th Edition. Further information can be obtained via the Developer Services pages of www.dwrcymru.com

The applicant is also advised that some public sewers and lateral drains may not be recorded on our maps of public sewers because they were originally privately owned and were transferred into public ownership by nature of the Water Industry (Schemes for Adoption of Private Sewers) Regulations 2011. The presence of such assets may affect the proposal. In order to assist us in dealing with the proposal the applicant may contact Dwr Cymru Welsh Water on 0800 085 3968 to establish the location and status of the apparatus. Under the Water Industry Act 1991 Dwr Cymru Welsh Water has rights of access to its apparatus at all times.

Only foul water from the development site shall be allowed discharge to the public sewerage system and this discharge shall be made between manhole reference number ST18814601 and ST18814501 as indicated on the extract of the Sewerage Network Plan attached to this decision notice.

Reason: To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment.

A water supply can be made available to serve this proposed development. The developer may be required to contribute, under Sections 40 - 41 of the Water Industry Act 1991, towards the provision of new off-site and/or on-site water mains and associated infrastructure. The level of contribution can be calculated upon receipt of detailed site layout plans which should be sent to the address above.

Our response is based on the information provided by your application. Should the proposal alter during the course of the application process we kindly request that we are re-consulted and reserve the right to make new representation.

To prevent pollution of the SSSI and the water environment, we recommend relevant Pollution Prevention Guidelines are followed during construction. Pollution Prevention Guidelines are available from NetRegs.

**RECOMMENDATION 6**: On first beneficial occupation, the applicant is encouraged to provide new residents with a sustainable travel pack, including details of all local public transport services, walking and cycling routes and local shopping and community facilities in order to promote travel by sustainable transport modes.

**RECOMMENDATION 7**: Prior to the commencement of development, the developer shall notify the local planning authority of the commencement of development, and shall display a site notice and plan on, or near the site, in accordance with the requirements of Article 12 of the Town & Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2016.

# 1. **DESCRIPTION OF DEVELOPMENT**

1.1 Planning Permission is sought for the redevelopment of the site of the Llanishen Rugby Club ground (A private members sports ground) accessed

from the Corner of Usk Road and Towy Road. In Llanishen for housing.

- 1.2 The scheme has been developed over the course of the application and plans and amended to revision 'E' which now indicate proposals for 25 units in total; comprising 14 detached, 8 semi-detached and one terrace of 3 properties, including 5 No. 'affordable' houses in accordance with Council Policy.
- 1.3 The scheme would also include for the provision of an extension to the Usk Grove highway and for the provision of a shared space access road to serve the new houses.

# 2. **DESCRIPTION OF THE SITE**

- 2.1 The site of the existing pitch is roughly rectangular but the site also includes for a lesser irregular plot of land to the NW. The site is approximately 1.2 hectares and is accessed from a SW corner position at the junction of Usk Road and Towy Road. It is currently maintained and used as a rugby pitch and the irregular area to the NW for ancillary car parking.
- 2.2 To the western boundary, the irregular area of land is defined by the rear garden boundaries of properties in Rheidol Close, the rear of a large garage building with flatted accommodation at upper level in Usk Grove, and the rear boundary of No 43 Usk Road, being one of 12 houses built by Waterstone Homes, on the grounds of the rugby club's former practice pitch, which are accessed from Usk Grove, a new highway serving the development and the rugby pitch car park. Planning Approval for this development was granted on appeal.
- 2.3 The site is enclosed with a wooded area to the north (designated TPO) (designated SINC), a belt of trees along its eastern boundary which along with a metal palisade fence separates it from the Llanishen Reservoir (designated SINC), Further to the east, the reservoir embankments are designated as a Listed Building and a SSSI; but the application site itself has no designated status. To the south, the side and rear garden of No. 14 Towy Road is currently being developed to provide for three additional dwellings.
- 2.4 The rubgy pitch is included within the boundary of the Nant Fawr River Corridor within the Adopted LDP, However it is physically separated from it by the aforementioned palisade fence and the Nant Fawr in this location is in the demise of Welsh Water; Canalised where it parallels the Llanishen reservoir and is not discernable above ground for the length of the application site because it has additionally been culverted in this area.
- 2.5 As a maintained sports pitch, the land is relatively flat and manicured. The adjacent irregular piece of land is maintained as a hard surface for car and coach parking. The pitch and car park are privately owned and are not ordinarily accessible to members of the general public. The site is enclosed with a weldmesh fence and gates.

- 2.6 The very extreme NE and SE corners of the site are indicated within the C2 Flood Zone on the NRW Development Advice Map.
- 2.7 A Sewer runs approximately 4m parallel to the Northern boundary of the site.
- 2.8 An attenuating sewer is located under the Usk Grove Carraigeway.
- 2.9 A proposed footpath link is indicated to the NE and SW corners of the site.

# 3. **SITE HISTORY**

3.1 There have been no previous proposals made in respect of the development of the land.

Planning Permission 10/01768 approved six floodlights to the rugby pitch in November 2010.

# 3.2 Related History

The existing and adjacent Waterstone Homes development was considered under planning application 08/00849/E and was recommended for approval by the planning officer in March 2008, but was refused by planning committee in October 2008 who considered that the development resulted in a loss of open space, however the application was subsequently allowed on appeal in Sept 2009.

Planning Permission 13/02699/DCO approved 3x No. Dwelling houses in the rear garden of 14 Towy Road in August 2014.

## 3.3 Other Material Considerations

16/01209/MJR Planning Permission for an Artificial Pitch and changing room facility at Llanishen High school. Granted January 2017

## 4. **POLICY FRAMEWORK**

Planning Policy Wales Edition 8, January 2016

## WG Technical Advice Notes

TAN 1: Joint Housing Land Availability Studies (2006) TAN 2: Planning and Affordable Housing (2006)

TAN 5: Nature Conservation and Planning (2009)

TAN 10: Tree Preservation Orders (1997)

TAN 11: Noise (1997) TAN 12: Design (2009)

TAN 15: Development and Flood Risk (2004)

TAN 16: Sport, Recreation and Open Space (2009)

TAN 18: Transport (2007) TAN 21: Waste (2001)

## Welsh Office Circular

11/99: Environmental Impact Assessment 30/06/99

16/94: Planning Out Crime 25/02/94

# Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006-2026 (Adopted January 2016)

KP5: GOOD QUALITY AND SUSTAINABLE DESIGN

KP6: NEW INFRASTRUCTURE KP7: PLANNING OBLIGATIONS KP8: SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORT

KP9: RESPONDING TO EVIDENCED ECONOMIC NEEDS

KP12: WASTE

KP13: RESPONDING TO EVIDENCED SOCIAL NEEDS

KP14: HEALTHY LIVING KP15: CLIMATE CHANGE

KP16: GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE H3: AFFORDABLE HOUSING EN3: LANDSCAPE PROTECTION

EN4: RIVER CORRIDORS EN5: DESIGNATED SITES

EN6: ECOLOGICAL NETWORKS AND FEATURES OF IMPORTANCE FOR BIODIVERSITY

**EN7: PRIORITY HABITATS AND SPECIES** 

EN8: TREES, WOODLANDS AND HEDGEROWS

EN13: AIR, NOISE, LIGHT POLLUTION AND LAND CONTAMINATION

**EN14: FLOOD RISK** 

T1: WALKING AND CYCLING

T5: MANAGING TRANSPORT IMPACTS

T6: IMPACT ON TRANSPORT NETWORKS AND SERVICES

T8: STRATEGIC RECREATIONAL ROUTES

C1: COMMUNITY FACILITIES

C4: PROTECTION OF OPEN SPACE

C5: PROVISION FOR OPEN SPACE, OUTDOOR RECREATION, CHILDREN'S PLAY AND SPORT

C6: HEALTH

W2: PROVISION FOR WASTE MANAGEMENT FACILITIES IN DEVELOPMENT

#### Other Material Considerations

Section 149 Equality Act 2010

Supplementary Planning Guidance [Supplementary to former Development Plans but also National Planning Guidance]

Access, Circulation and Parking Standards Jan 2010 Affordable Housing Mar 07 Biodiversity Part 1 - Approved June 2011 Biodiversity Part 2 - Approved June 2011

Community Facilities and Residential Development Mar 07

Developer Contributions for Transport Jan 2010

Householder Design Guide Mar 07

Infill Sites Design Guide April 2011

Open Space Mar 08 including May 2011 update to Section 106 Baseline

Contribution Figure

Residential Design Guide Mar 08

Trees and Development Mar 07

Waste Collection & Storage Facilities Mar 07

Supplementary Planning Guidance [Supplementary to LDP]

Waste January 2017

Note Supplementary Planning Guidance relating to Planning Obligations and Residential Design Guide 2017 may be adopted and replace previously adopted SPG on these topics by the time planning committee debate this item.

#### Other Material Considerations

16/01209/MJR Planning Permission for an Artificial Pitch and changing room facility at Llanishen High school. Granted January 2017

## 5. **INTERNAL CONSULTEE RESPONSES**

## 5.1 Placemaking

The garages and parking spaces associated with Plots 20, 22, 23 and 25 would be better relocated to the other side of the dwellings in order that the dwellings themselves form the dominant features within the street scene

The parking provision associated with plots 15, 16 and 17 would be highly prominent within the street scene. A reduction in the amount of parking associated with these dwelling might therefore be considered.

The provision of high quality and robust landscaping in this area would be expected in order to soften the aesthetic of the area.

A change in the finishing materials within the parking bays should also be considered in order to break up the extent of tarmac.

Details should be provided of the landscaping treatment proposed within the open space opposite plot 21. It is important that this space would be useable and not just left over space after planning. The future management and maintenance of the space should also be considered.

The provision of a footpath link between the site and what appears to be Rheidol Close (to the west of Plot 14) is welcomed as this would allow more direct pedestrian access to Llanishen railway station and therefore improve the sustainability credentials of the scheme.

It is unclear where the footpath link indicated between the dwellings proposed in plots 3 and 4 would lead. If this allows access to the recreational open space to the south of the site it would be supported provided it would be overlooked by the dwellings in plots 3 and 4.

Consideration would be expected to be given to ensuring that both of the above mentioned footpath links are appropriately lit.

# 5.2 Traffic and Transportation

The Transport Officer's observations will be reported at Committee.

The Transport officer has previously confirmed that there is no objection to the principle of the residential development of the land, subject to the following provisos, conditions and S106 undertakings:

The development is confirmed to be in easy reach of a number of sustainable transport modes in respect of a principal bus route on Fidlas Road; Train services accessed via Llanishen railway station; and walking and cycling routes through local parkland and should therefore accord with the approved parking guidelines in terms of minimum/maximum off street car parking provision.

Convenience shopping and services are also noted in Llanishen Village and at Rhyd y penau crossroads a short distance away, and supermarket provision exists within approximately 1 mile of the site. As such there should be no need to access local services by car.

In support of a sustainable transport agenda, It would be an expectation that the development would provide for a new shelter and bus border at the City inbound stop on Fidlas Road near the junction of Usk Road. This could be achieved via a number of alternative mechanisms ranging from a financial transport contribution, to installation of the shelter and border by the developer and would be a matter controlled by condition or legal agreement.

The junctions of Fidlas Road as an arterial route, and Usk Road and Ewenny Road as lesser roads are noted to be right angled, and although subject to a short double yellow line traffic order, are noted to realise manoeuvring difficulties for drivers accessing or egressing the roads. Given that the new development will increase car usage at these junctions it is considered appropriate to require the applicant to reimburse the Council for any necessary modification of the traffic orders considered necessary to reduce the potential for vehicle conflict.

It is considered that a financial contribution of a maximum of £40,000 would cover the cost of such works and that this, or the undertaking of the works themselves to the satisfaction of the highway officer, should be secured by \$106 agreement.

Standard conditions would apply in respect of the housing development to

secure cycle and car parking provision; a construction management plan with particular reference to site access constraints; provision of a sustainable travel pack for new residents; and for post development repair of any carriageway surfaces or adopted kerbing as might be damaged as a result of construction traffic.

Works to adopted highways would need to be approved by means of section 278/38 agreement as appropriate. The technical specification of the proposed shared surface access road will require detailed consideration.

# 5.3 Housing

This scheme would generate a need for 20% on site affordable housing (5 units), and all of the units delivered as affordable rented tenure. The developer has identified a mix of units below, and this is acceptable on the basis of transfer to a Registered Social Landlord (RSL) at currently agreed transfer costs:

3 x 2 bed houses

1 x 3 bed house

1 x 4 bed house

All of the units would need to be built to Welsh Government DQR standards, and units will be allocated from the Common Waiting List.

For clarification, if there are any roads or public open space/realm/green infrastructure within the site that will not be adopted (ie privately managed), then neither the RSL nor their tenants will be able to make additional contributions to the management of these aspects of the scheme. The price to be paid by an RSL to acquire the properties relates solely to the purchase of the completed affordable units, including finishes to the external garden/communal space within property curtilages.

Low cost home ownership will not be accepted on this site.

#### 5.4 Trees

The amended scheme represents a marginal improvement on the previous in that fence lines will be offset from the site boundary and the gap between the fence line and site boundary will be planted with native species, to provide a 'buffer'.

Substantive changes have not been made to the layout to allow for a full ecotone, and as such I fear that nuisance problems will be an issue at this site and result in requests for unsuitable pruning and felling of trees, and a reduced quality of life for residents.

Should you be minded to recommend approval of this development, I recommend attachment of conditions requiring the submission of an

Arboricultural Method Statement and Tree Protection Plan, and finalised landscaping scheme comprising scaled planting plan, plant schedule, topsoil and subsoil specification, tree pit section and plan views, planting methodology and aftercare methodology. The aftercare methodology should include details of long-term management for buffer zones. The landscaping specification should be informed by a Soil Resource Survey and Plan prepared in accordance with the 2009 DEFRA Code. C4R or similar should be applied to require replacement of any failed planting.

# 5.5 Pollution Control Noise Air and Light Pollution

To protect the amenities of occupiers of other premises in the vicinity attention is drawn to the provisions of Section 60 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974 in relation to the control of noise from demolition and construction activities. Further to this the applicant is advised that no noise audible outside the site boundary adjacent to the curtilage of residential property shall be created by construction activities in respect of the implementation of this consent outside the hours of 0800-1800 hours Mondays to Fridays and 0800 - 1300 hours on Saturdays or at any time on Sunday or public holidays. The applicant is also advised to seek approval for any proposed piling operations.

#### 5.6 Pollution Control Contaminated Land

Should there be any importation of soils to develop the garden/landscaped areas of the development, or any site won recycled material, or materials imported as part of the construction of the development, then it must be demonstrated that they are suitable for the end use. This is to prevent the introduction or recycling of materials containing chemical or other potential contaminants which may give rise to potential risks to human health and the environment for the proposed end use.

No objection is raised to the proposals subject to the imposition of conditions relating to contaminated land measures — unforeseen contamination; imported soils; imported aggregates and use of site won materials together with a contamination and unstable land advisory notice.

#### 5.7 **Parks**

# **Design Comments**

My main concern on the scheme relates to the proximity of houses to the woodland along the northern boundary and the line of trees along the eastern boundary. Experience from many years of maintenance has shown that siting houses too close to mature trees, whether in woodland or individual trees, leads to ongoing problems with shading, complaints about trees growing over gardens, and the need for frequent pruning. Plot no 8 looks to have a particular issue with trees overgrowing on two sides and in some cases directly adjacent to the house.

On most sites with woodland the Council look to avoid this by creating a 15m wide ecotone. It is clear from the DAS that attempts have been made to reduce the impact by lengthening gardens and creating a wide flower margin, although I'm not clear of the width of this and what protection it will receive if within gardens. The woodland and trees don't appear to be in Council ownership.

The other query relates to the proposed footpath in the North West and south east corners and land adjacent to it. It's not clear from the plan who would be responsible for maintaining it. There also seem to be a number of other areas of miscellaneous verge outside the boundary walls of properties eg adjacent 1, 22 and 23, 20 and 25, and 18 / 19 where ownership and responsibility for maintenance also needs to be clearly designated as these areas outside gardens often become unkempt, with nobody knowing who has responsibility.

## Open Space Provision

These comments relate to the Supplementary Planning Guidance for Open Space 2008

The Council's Supplementary Planning Guidance - Open Space requires provision of a satisfactory level and standard of open space on all new housing/student developments, or an off-site contribution towards existing open space for smaller scale developments where new on-site provision is not applicable.

Based on the information provided on the number and type of units, I have calculated an open space requirement of **0.154 ha** based on the criteria set for Housing accommodation.

As very little public open space is being provided on-site, the developers will be required to make a financial contribution towards the provision of open space off-site, or the improvement (including design and maintenance) of existing open space in the locality. Based on the above assessment the contribution payable will be £64,752.

In the event that the Council is minded to approve the application, I assume it will be necessary for the applicant and the Council to enter into a Section 106 Agreement to secure payment of the contribution.

Information on the open space projects reasonably related to the development, to which the contribution will be allocated, will be provided for inclusion within the Section 106 Agreement. This would involve local consultation with various parties and be subject to Member approval.

## 5.8 **Regeneration**

The proposals would need to accord with Supplementary Planning Guidance on the provision of Community Facilities.

Contributions are sought from proposed residential developments containing

25 or more new dwellings. It is considered that a development of this size would increase the demand on local community facilities beyond their existing or planned capacity and / or where existing facilities are of an unsatisfactory standard and would require further investment to make suitable for use.

The current SPG calculator would require a financial contribution of £29,007 toward the provision or enhancement of community facilities in the area

#### 5.9 Waste

Each property will require the following for recycling and waste collections:

- 1 x 140 litre bin for general waste
- 1 x 25 litre kerbside caddy for food waste
- Green bags for mixed recycling (equivalent to 140 litres)

The storage of which must be sensitively integrated into the design. Current site plans give no details with respect to the proposed storage location for waste. Please amend site plans to show the proposed storage areas.

It is preferable for the bins to be stored within the rear gardens. If this is not possible, the bins can be stored at the front of the property, but must be screened from view of the highway.

Please advise the owner/applicant that since 27<sup>th</sup> July 2015, the developers of all new residential units are required to purchase the bin provision required for each unit. The bins have to meet the Council's specifications and can be purchased directly by contacting the Waste Management's commercial team.

The kitchens should be designed to allow the separation of waste into three waste streams; general, recycling and food waste, in order to encourage the correct disposal of waste.

Please ensure the road surfacing is strong enough to withstand the weight of the refuse collection vehicles. Surfaces such as block paving, are not suitable as they are prone to subsidence.

Please refer the agent/architect to the Waste Collection and Storage Facilities Supplementary Planning Guidance for further relevant information.

## 6. **EXTERNAL CONSULTEE RESPONSES**

#### 6.1 Welsh Water

We refer to your planning consultation relating to the above site, and we can provide the following comments in respect to the proposed development.

We would request that if you are minded to grant Planning Consent for the above development that the <u>Conditions and Advisory Notes</u> provided below are included within the consent to ensure no detriment to existing residents or the environment and to Dwr Cymru Welsh Water's assets.

## **SEWERAGE**

## Conditions

No development shall commence until a drainage scheme for the site has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The scheme shall provide for the disposal of foul, surface and land water, and include an assessment of the potential to dispose of surface and land water by sustainable means. Thereafter the scheme shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details prior to the occupation of the development and no further foul water, surface water and land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage system. Reason: To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment.

#### Advisory

The applicant may need to apply to Dwr Cymru / Welsh Water for any connection to the public sewer under S106 of the Water industry Act 1991. If the connection to the public sewer network is either via a lateral drain (i.e. a drain which extends beyond the connecting property boundary) or via a new sewer (i.e. serves more than one property), it is now a mandatory requirement to first enter into a Section 104 Adoption Agreement (Water Industry Act 1991). The design of the sewers and lateral drains must also conform to the Welsh Ministers Standards for Gravity Foul Sewers and Lateral Drains, and conform with the publication "Sewers for Adoption"- 7th Edition. Further information can be obtained via the Developer Services pages of www.dwrcymru.com

The applicant is also advised that some public sewers and lateral drains may not be recorded on our maps of public sewers because they were originally privately owned and were transferred into public ownership by nature of the Water Industry (Schemes for Adoption of Private Sewers) Regulations 2011. The presence of such assets may affect the proposal. In order to assist us in dealing with the proposal the applicant may contact Dwr Cymru Welsh Water on 0800 085 3968 to establish the location and status of the apparatus. Under the Water Industry Act 1991 Dwr Cymru Welsh Water has rights of access to its apparatus at all times.

Only foul water from the development site shall be allowed discharge to the public sewerage system and this discharge shall be made between manhole reference number ST18814601 and ST18814501 as indicated on the extract of the Sewerage Network Plan attached to this decision notice.

Reason: To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment.

## WATER SUPPLY

Dwr Cymru Welsh Water has no objection to the proposed development. A water supply can be made available to serve this proposed development. The developer may be required to contribute, under Sections 40 - 41 of the Water Industry Act 1991, towards the provision of new off-site and/or on-site water mains and associated infrastructure. The level of contribution can be

calculated upon receipt of detailed site layout plans which should be sent to the address above.

Our response is based on the information provided by your application. Should the proposal alter during the course of the application process we kindly request that we are re-consulted and reserve the right to make new representation.

## 6.2 Natural Resources Wales

We do not object to the application as submitted. We provide the following advice in relation to proposal; flood risk management; protected sites and European protected species.

## Flood Risk Management

The application site lies partially within Zone C2, as defined by the Development Advice Map (DAM) referred to under Technical Advice Note 15: Development and Flood Risk (TAN15) (July 2004). Our Flood Map information, which is updated on a quarterly basis, confirms the site to be within the 1% (1 in 100 years) and 0.1% (1 in 1000 year) fluvial flood outlines of the Nant Fawr, a designated main river.

The submitted site layout plan prepared by Spring Design, Ref: 2174/101, Rev: C, dated Feb 2016, shows there is no built development located within the flood zones. In consideration of this, we have no adverse comments to make from a flood risk perspective.

Please consult us again if the site layout changes and any built development is located within the flood zones.

We recommend you consult your drainage department in their capacity as Lead Local Flood Authority in relation to surface water flooding and drainage.

#### **Protected Sites**

The application site is adjacent to Llanishen and Lisvane Reservoir Embankments Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI). This SSSI is designated for its grassland fungi feature. Furthermore, the application site is approximately 500m to the south west Lisvane Reservoir SSSI. This SSSI is designated for its overwintering bird feature.

The effect of trampling and dog fouling from unauthorised access to the open space at Llanishen and Lisvane Reservoirs is having a detrimental effect on the grassland fungi features of the Llanishen and Lisvane Reservoir Embankments SSSI.

Discussions between NRW and Welsh Water are underway to consider the potential for managed public access to the site in the future.

We note the majority of the proposed development site is allocated as river corridor (EN4) within your LDP. The SSSIs also form part of the allocated river

corridor. The loss of open recreational space arising from the proposed development, coupled with the likely increase in the number of householders likely to access the open space at Llanishen and Lisvane Reservoirs, has the potential to increase the pressure on the grassland embankments and fungi interest of the Llanishen and Lisvane Reservoirs Embankments SSSI. We consider it would be beneficial to restrict direct access from the development to the SSSI, for example, through fencing.

# Advice to Applicant

To prevent pollution of the SSSI and the water environment, we recommend relevant Pollution Prevention Guidelines are followed during construction. Pollution Prevention Guidelines are available from NetRegs.

# **European Protected Species**

We recommend you seek the advice of your in-house ecologist to determine if there is a reasonable likelihood of bats, a European protected species, being present within the application site. If so, in accordance with Technical Advice Note 5: Nature Conservation and Planning (paragraph 6.2.2) a bat survey may be required. The survey should be carried out in accordance with 'Bat Surveys; Good Practice Guidelines 3rd Edition' published by the Bat Conservation Trust 2016. Please consult us again if any survey undertaken finds that bats are present at the site and you require further advice from us.

#### Other Matters

Our comments above only relate specifically to matters included on our checklist Natural Resources Wales and Planning Consultations (March 2015) which is published on our website. We have not considered potential effects on other matters and do not rule out the potential for the proposed development to affect other interests, including environmental interests of local importance. We advise the applicant that, in addition to planning permission, it is their responsibility to ensure they secure all other permits/consents relevant to their development. Please refer to our website for further details.

## 6.3 **Sports Wales**

Thank you for sending the consultation letter. I am responding on behalf of Sport Wales and have discussed the plans with Rhodri Edwards from Fields in Trust.

Reference is made to the relevant planning policy in Planning Policy Wales. Paragraph 11.1.12 states that playing fields should be protected except where:

- facilities can best be retained and enhanced through the redevelopment of a small part of the site;
- alternative provision of equivalent community benefit is made available;
   Or
- · there is an excess of such provision in the area

We understand from the Design and Access Statement that "A key principle of the proposal is that the loss of the rugby pitch will be compensated for by the provision of a 3G pitch at Llanishen High School".

We have given consideration to whether the proposal meets the second exception by providing alternative provision of equivalent community benefit.

While no further information about the 3G is included in application 16/00711/MUR, the WRU has provided us with a set of slides from their strategic plan for the clubhouse relocation and artificial pitch, with Option 2 setting out details for the development at Llanishen High School.

In respect of Planning Policy Wales, Sport Wales believes that a new 3G pitch at Llanishen High School would provide equivalent provision and an increased benefit to the school as well as the rugby club and community sports groups, through improved quality facilities. We understand this would include changing rooms, artificial pitch and floodlighting that would serve the club, the school and wider community needs.

Therefore on the condition that the 3G development is able to go ahead, Sport Wales has no objections to application 16/00711/MUR.

## 7. **REPRESENTATIONS**

- 7.1 The application has been advertised in the press and extensively on site. Neighbours have been notified of the proposals and advised of amendments. Ward Members have also been advised of the proposals.
- 7.2 Two Petitions of Objection have been received, one of 110 signatures; one of 5 signatures.
- 7.3 Objections have been received from 30 properties in Rheidol Close, Gelligaer Gardens; Llandennis Road; Everest Ave; Old Vicarage Close; Clos Tecwyn; Rhyd y Penau Road; Beatty Avenue; Usk Road; St Frances Road; Mill Road; Station Road; Llyswen Road; Cyncoed Place; Towy Road; Sherbourne Ave; Chartwell Drive; Dan y Heol; Cheriton Drive; West Rise; Tanglewood Drive; Fidlas Road; 'The woodlands' in Lisvane; and from two local residents of undisclosed address.

The reasons for objection are summarised as follows:

- Traffic Congestion
- Out of accord with LDP, Contrary to policiesEN4 [River Corridors]; C4 (Protection of open space), C5 (Provision of open space), C6 (Health), EN5 (Designated Sites); EN6 (Ecological networks); EN14 (Flooding); T5 (Managing Transport Impacts); T6 (Impact on Transport Networks); and KP5 (Good Quality and Sustainable Design) and KP16 (Green Infrastructure).
- Destruction of trees to East of the site

- Invasion of Landscape Buffer of the Reservoirs
- Proximity and relationship of affordable housing on Rheidol Close
- Construction nuisance
- Proximity and relationship of dwellings to 43 Usk Road
- Drainage capacity
- · Hard surfacing will exacerbate potential for Flooding
- · Traffic Hazard at Junctions of Fidlas road
- Loss of recreational open space
- Lack of Public Open Space within the development
- Clustering of Affordable Housing
- Loss of Privacy and overlooking (21 Usk Road)
- Impact on Trees
- Impact on Wildlife
- Footpath proposals
- Destruction of a playing field
- Loss of a Natural Heritage Asset
- Affordable Housing Design
- Reduction in the quality of life of Local Residents
- No overriding need for housing on this site given the strategic allocations confirmed by the LDP
- Lack of obligation to provide the 3G pitch at Llanishen High School as a compensatory community facility.
- Inability to maintain Wildlife Margins / Potential for fly tipping
- Cumulative impact on Highway network with Churchlands development.
- Impact on SINC (Gwern y Bendy wood)
- Impact on SSSI (Llanishen Reservoir)

## 7.4 **Julie Morgan AM** expresses her concern

"I understand the need for more houses in Cardiff but do not think these should be built on the River Corridor. There will be a large number of homes built in Cardiff North as a result of the growing population and the decisions of the Local Development Plan, which will of course change the nature of the area. One of the compensations for more house building and to preserve the unique nature of the Cardiff landscape has been the identification of the land as a River Corridor which will be protected and enhanced. I believe there should be a presumption against development on this land.

The LDP has only recently been passed and it would be disappointing if the Council agreed to development on this particular piece of land".

# 7.5 Cardiff Civic Society

I am writing to object to planning application: 16/00711/MJR. This planning application affects the Nant Fawr River Corridor. Cardiff Council's recently adopted Local Development Plan included both a policy to protect the river corridors and a map that, for the first time, clearly shows which land is included in the river corridor designation. The policy, EN4 says: The Natural Heritage, character and other key features of Cardiff's river corridors will be protected,

promoted and enhanced, together with facilitating sustainable access and recreation.

This planning application is adjacent to the Llanishen and Lisvane Reservoir Embankments Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) and Gwern-y-Bendy wood which is a Site of Importance for Nature Conservation (SINC). The land affected by the planning application is also clearly shown in the LDP as being an integral part of the Nant Fawr River Corridor.

Cardiff Civic Society firmly believes that Cardiff Council should adhere to its own planning policies and should reject this planning application. We are also concerned that if planning permission is granted this will be used as a precedent, and will encourage developers to submit further applications that will erode the Nant Fawr and other river corridors in Cardiff.

## 8. ANALYSIS

# 8.1 Environmental Impact Assessment

The Environmental Impact Assessment Regulations require all developments to be screened to consider if an Environmental Statement would be required to fully assess their environmental Impact. Such Statements are normally only required if a development is considered likely to have a significant environmental Impact in terms of its scale, context, resource uptake or hazardous nature of outputs.

Current thresholds indicated in the EIA Regulations suggest that an Environmental Statement will be more likely to be required for residential developments on more than 5 hectares of land, or exceeding 150 houses.

The site is Circa 1.2 hectares in area, and comprises only 25 houses, and would provide housing in the context of existing residential development of very similar character and density. The quantum or character of development is therefore not considered likely to result in any significant environmental effect.

Neither would the proposal require any significant resource needs for construction, or to result in any unusual or hazardous outputs in terms of its use. The site is not in a 'sensitive' area as defined by the regulations, and although designated as part of the Nant Fawr River Corridor, the site comprises land currently developed as a playing field and car park, which offer little ecological value in themselves.

Such impacts and mitigation as may be required to offset any impact of the development on the adjacent but enclosed watercourse, SSSI reservoir and SINC woodland (all outside of the development site) would ordinary be considered as part of the planning application assessment under local development plan policies.

The works are therefore concluded not to be EIA development for the purposes of assessment under the Environmental Impact Assessment Regulations and

are not considered likely to have such significant environmental effects as to warrant the submission of an Environmental Statement to allow the Local Planning Authority to understand the environmental impacts of the proposals.

#### 8.2 Land Use

It is noted that part of the site is identified as open space in the most recent open space survey. In view of this, Policy C4 of the adopted Local Development Plan (LDP) and approved Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on Open Space (March 2008) are relevant.

Although it is noted that the Open Space SPG was approved in connection with the now superseded City of Cardiff Local Plan, pending approval of new SPG it is considered material to the development management process as it is consistent with the new policy framework set out in the adopted LDP.

Policy C4 seeks to protect open space that has significant functional (including land that can accommodate formal/or informal recreational uses), conservation, environmental or amenity value through only allowing proposals where:

- they would not cause or exacerbate a deficiency of open space in
- accordance with the most recent open space study; and
- the open space has no significant functional or amenity value; and
- the open space is of no significant quality; or
- the developers make satisfactory compensatory provision;

#### and in all cases

• the open space has no significant nature or historic conservation importance.

This policy reflects national planning policy relating to open space set out in Planning Policy Wales and Technical Advice Note 16 relating to Sport, Recreation and Open Space (January 2009).

- 8.3 The most recent survey of open space classifies the majority (0.94 hectares) of this site as formal recreational open space. Therefore, in order to accord fully with Policy C4 the application needs to be assessed against the following as set out in section 3 of the Open Space SPG:
  - the level of existing provision of recreational open space assessed
  - against the standard.
  - the amenity value the SPG states that there should be an objection
  - to proposals which would adversely affect the appearance of open
  - spaces which significantly contribute to the visual appearance of an
  - area.
  - The nature conservation value of the open space.
  - The acceptability of compensatory facilities.

8.4 In terms of existing provision of recreational open space the Open Space SPG (Page 25) sets out the amount of recreational open space relative to the standard for each ward within the city. This shows that the Llanishen ward overall has a deficit of 7.78 hectares of recreational open space (based on the 2.43 ha per 1,000 population standard) and therefore this proposal will exacerbate a local and city wide deficiency of recreational open space. In order to address this matter satisfactory compensatory provision will be required and further guidance on this is provided in paragraphs 3.19 to 3.21 of the Open Space SPG (as follows).

# 8.5 Compensatory Facilities

- 3.19 Where a development proposal involving the loss of open space would cause or exacerbate a local or city-wide deficiency of recreational open space, compensatory open space or an alternative provision of equivalent community benefit may be acceptable.
- 3.20 Compensatory open space/replacement facilities will be assessed having regard to the importance of the resource to be lost and the needs of the locality. The quantity, size and community benefit of the compensatory area should normally be at least equal to the area being lost. Replacement facilities should always be reasonably related to the original site, to serve the catchment population affected by the loss. Offers of compensatory open space/replacement facilities outside the threshold distances identified in figure 1 will not normally be acceptable.
- 3.21 However, in some circumstances it may be more appropriate not to exactly replace existing provision and provide an alternative form of provision more appropriate to the needs of the local population. For example, the loss of a site which is deemed of poor quality and low value to the local community may be better compensated for by investment in qualitative improvements to other open spaces in the locality or by consolidating an area of open space to provide a better quality facility of more value to the local community
- 8.6 In this respect it is noted that the landowner is proposing to provide a replacement all-purpose 3G pitch on the Llanishen High School site which is located near the site and therefore it could be argued that these qualitative gains outweigh the proposed quantitative loss of recreational open space. In terms of amenity value. it is also noted that the proposal will be accompanied by a landscaping scheme which will ensure there is no unacceptable impact on visual amenity. Given this, subject to no adverse impact on nature conservation value the proposal does not raise any land use planning policy concerns.

In addition Policy C5 of the adopted LDP requires developers of new housing to provide public open space for future occupiers commensurate with their needs and this site would also qualify on this basis.

# 8.7 Good Quality and Sustainable Design

Policy KP5 promotes good quality and sustainable design which responds to the local character and context of the built and landscape setting so that layout, scale, form, massing, height, density, colour, materials, detailing and impact on the built and natural heritage are all addressed within development proposals; which provide legible development which is easy to get around and which ensures a sense of continuity and enclosure; which create interconnected streets and spaces as distinctive places, which are safe, and accessible; and which provide a healthy and convenient environment for all users that supports the principles of community safety, encourages walking and cycling, and which enable essential services and community facilities to be accessible by sustainable means and which maximise the contribution networks of open spaces make to encourage healthier lifestyles; whilst ensuring no undue effect on the amenity of neighbouring occupiers and connecting positively to surrounding communities.

# 8.8 Scale and Layout

The proposal offers a perimeter layout and central core of housing on a close arrangement with vehicular access extending from and returning to Usk Grove via shared surface carriageway. The return highway would be staggered a short distance to the south of Usk Grove.

The house types are typically akin to those in Usk Grove and at two and two and a half storey (room in attic) height. There is no objection to this scale of development in the given context.

The amended layout attempts to address the tree officer's comments, in increasing the undeveloped area near the North and East perimeter of the site. The applicant accepts that the trees on the eastern boundary will result in a shadow cast over the gardens of units 3 through 8, but has positioned the units as far forward of the trees as possible.

A similar exercise has been undertaken with properties closest to the Northern woodland, which although they would not cast a shadow fall onto the site, would extend over the property boundaries and so properties are positioned to allow for maximum uninterrupted garden space away from the trees considerably.

The comments of the placemaking team regarding the relocation of the garages and parking spaces associated with Plots 20, 22, 23 and 25 are noted, however the movement of such structures would potentially adversely affect instances of overlooking, and the street scene impact of the garages is not considered so detrimental as to warrant the refusal of planning permission.

# 8.9 Access and Parking

The site is sustainably located and easily accessible by foot, unpowered and powered two wheelers, bus and train as well as by car.

The level of off street parking has been reduced since the original submission to accord with current SPG. The scheme provides for a maximum of 2 off street car parking spaces for a 2 bed house; 2 spaces for a three bed house; and 3 spaces for 4 bed and above. This is considered appropriate.

# 8.10 Privacy

The layout provides for a minimum privacy distance of 10.5 between habitable rooms and boundaries, and 21m between habitable rooms on adjacent plots. This is the recommended minimum indicated with supplementary planning guidance.

## 8.11 Amenity space

All properties have generous enclosed gardens. Amended plans increase the depth of gardens, and the position of properties on the Eastern side of the site which would otherwise be more significantly affected by the shadowfall of trees. The amount of private usable amenity space for all dwellings is considered more than adequate.

#### 8.12 **Aesthetic**

The Waterstones Homes house styles are considered acceptable in the context of Usk Grove and the area generally. It will be a requirement that the affordable housing units would share a common materials palette with adjacent market housing to provide for a continuity of aesthetic Submitted plans indicate the dwellings to be finished in facing brick and slate tile, and to be similar to other residences in Usk Grove, The exact palette of building materials can be controlled by condition

## 8.13 **Equalities**

Section 149 Equality Act 2010 requires that due regard be given to any actual or potential differential impact of the development on the needs of those with protected characteristics.

It is not apparent that the proposals would result in any abnormal differential impact in respect of the requirements of the Equality Act.

## 8.14 Infrastructure

Policy KP6 attempts to ensure that new development will make appropriate provision for, or contribute towards, all essential infrastructure required as a consequence of the development, and that this will include transportation and highways access, circulation, parking, public transport provision, walking and cycling; utility services; flood mitigation; affordable housing; community buildings and facilities; open space, waste and recycling facilities; and appropriately address the natural and built environment. These are considered below.

## 8.15 **Drainage**

No response has been received from the Council's drainage section, however it would be an expectation that Surface water drainage from the site could be managed by way of Sustainable Drainage Techniques. The planning officer notes the adjacent watercourse and would suggest that the developer investigate access to that facility. The comments of Welsh Water are also noted and a condition requiring the submission of a comprehensive drainage system is recommended.

#### 8.16 Flood Risk

Policies KP 15 and EN14 seek to ensure that development will not be subject to flooding or contribute to flooding elsewhere.

The very NW and SE corners of the site are within the C2 Flood Zone C2, as defined by the Development Advice Map (DAM) referred to under Technical Advice Note 15. and to be within the 1% (1 in 100 year) and 0.1% (1 in 1000 year) fluvial flood outlines of the Nant Fawr. However proposed layout of dwellings shows there is no built development located within the flood zone. As such the Planning Officer is satisfied that the consequences of flooding have been adequately considered by the developer and that it is justifiable to allow residential development in this location.

The consequence of providing housing on an otherwise free draining application site will be to increase the amount of non-permeable surface, and consequently surface water run-off. To ensure that this will not increase the potential for flooding the developer will be required to investigate and provide as appropriate, a Sustainable Urban Drainage System (SUDS) and permeable surfaces where appropriate.

## 8.17 AIR, NOISE, LIGHT POLLUTION AND LAND CONTAMINATION

Policy EN13 provides that development will not be permitted where it would cause or result in unacceptable harm to health, local amenity, interests of nature conservation, landscape or built heritage importance because of air, noise, light pollution or the presence of unacceptable levels of land contamination.

It is not envisaged that the scheme would result in any abnormal light, air or noise pollution for existing nearby residents, or wildlife, especially in the context of the existing use of the site as a floodlit sports pitch.

The comments of the contaminated land officer are also noted and concurred with in terms of the likelihood of contaminants on the site, but the suggested conditions regarding unforeseen contamination and imported materials also considered appropriate, and recommended.

#### 8.18 PROTECTION OF OPEN SPACE

LDP Policy C4 states that development will not be permitted on areas of open space unless:

- i. It would not cause or exacerbate a deficiency of open space in accordance with the most recent open space study; and
- ii. The open space has no significant functional or amenity value; and
- iii. The open space is of no significant quality; or
- iv. The developers make satisfactory compensatory provision; and, in all cases:
- v. The open space has no significant nature or historic conservation importance.

The site has no significant nature or conservation value; the pitch is of significance as a piece of recreational open space, but is proposed to be replaced by a superior facility; the pitch has little or no amenity open space value as it is a private facility not available to the general public other than as invited spectators. Its loss would contribute to the overall deficit of open space within the ward, but this is proposed to be compensated against by the applicant.

The land use policy position identifies that the acceptability of the development of the site must include for the weighing of the merit of any alternative recreational open space provision against the merit of that lost under the proposal.

In isolation, without any alternative open space provision, the proposals would not be supported.

However, If considered alongside the provision of a 3G pitch and changing room facility at Llanishen Highschool, as is proposed by the land owner of the site, and which obtained planning permission at January planning committee, the planning officer concludes that the value of the current private recreational open space would not be lost, and arguably if provided to the quality envisaged, to be of enhanced amenity benefit to an increased number of the local community, in the form of pupils at the school, their parents, other visiting schools, as well as to members of the Llanishen Rugby Club, and other teams.

Provided that a mechanism can be agreed to guarantee the provision of such a facility, the Planning Officer concludes that this would be an acceptable compensatory provision and would enable the development to achieve policy compliance with policy C4

# 8.19 PROVISION FOR OPEN SPACE, OUTDOOR RECREATION, CHILDREN'S PLAY AND SPORT

LDP Policy C5 requires that new residential developments of over 8 units make provision for functional open space for outdoor recreation, children's play and sport at a ratio of 2.43 hectares per 1000 projected population.

The development results in a loss of approximately 9800m2 of private open space, and provides for only a very small area (approximately 172m2) of meaningful on site public open space.

Whilst the acceptability of the development in principle will be dependent on the provision of satisfactory compensatory open space provision; the development would properly need to retain or provide for on-site open space to serve the new residential occupiers.

As the development is deficient in this respect, the Parks officer's request for a commuted payment of £64,752 is therefore noted, considered appropriate, and considered to meet planning tests.

Given the proximity of the development to the nearby park, the planning officer does not consider that new residents would be at a dis-benefit in respect of there being limited on site provision of public open space, and that the maintenance and enhancement of nearby existing facilities is appropriate in this instance and will also serve the wider community.

## 8.20 SUSTAINABLE TRANSPORT/MANAGING TRANSPORT IMPACTS

LDP Policy KP8 seeks to promote development properly integrated with transport infrastructure and Policies T1, T5 and T6 seek to ensure sustainable transport opportunities and appropriate enhancement of the highway network as required by new development proposals. The Policies seek to promote a 50:50 modal split between journeys by car and journeys by walking, cycling and public transport; reduce travel demand and dependence on the car; enable and maximise use of sustainable and active modes of transport and promote a modal hierarchy in favour of the most sustainable modes.;

The development is confirmed to be in easy reach of a number of sustainable public transport options in respect of a principal bus route on Fidlas Road; and train services accessed via Llanishen; Ty Glas and Heath Halt railway stations, The site is also offers easy access to walking and cycling routes through local parkland.

Comments regarding the capacity of the junctions at Usk Road and Ewenny Road are acknowledged, but should be able to be overcome with minor amendments to traffic orders at those junctions.

Convenience shopping and services are noted in Llanishen Village and at Rhyd y penau crossroads a short distance away, and supermarket provision exists within approximately 1 mile of the site. As such there should be no need to access local services by car.

Off street parking proposals accord with the adopted parking guidelines and this is welcomed.

Comments regarding the foot path linkages to the NW and SE corners of the

site and the local park and Gwern y bendy wood/Rheidol Close respectively are noted. Members of the rugby club are noted to use the southern link from the 'B' pitches located in the Local Park to the current 'A' pitch which is the subject of this application at present, and this route, although informal would appear to have been established for some time. The route to the north appears originally to have been connected to pathway connecting back to Rheidol Close from which a more formal pathway allows foot passage north to Llanishen Railway station via West Rise and The Rise.

Both paths are shown on currant Ordnance bases but are of unknown status. There would however be no objection to increasing the pedestrian permeability of the site by means of the linkages proposed.

The Transportation Officer has noted that an existing bus stop on Fidlas Road near the junction with Usk Road is lacking a shelter. The applicant has been asked to contribute, or provide such a shelter to the maximum value of £40,000

#### 8.21 RIVER CORRIDORS

LDP Policy EN4 states that the Natural Heritage, character and other key features of Cardiff's river corridors will be protected, promoted and enhanced, together with facilitating sustainable access and recreation.

The very many objections received which suggest that the development is contrary to Policy ENV4 are noted, however each proposal must be viewed on its merit in terms of impact and policy compliance.

The site is loated within the designated Nant Fawr River Corridor where Policy ENV4 applies.

However Policy ENV4 does not preclude development within the river corridor, rather more to protect its natural heritage, character and other key features.

The application site is a piece of land developed as a flood lit rugby pitch and car park, and its development for housing would therefore not impact on the natural heritage of the Nant Fawr. In respect of any potential change in character, the managed and manicured appearance of the pitch also seen against the existing backdrop of Usk Grove, is already considered to have an urban character, the development of which for housing would have a not dissimilar relationship to housing adjacent to the river corridor further north or south.

Policy EN4 also states that the river corridors will be promoted and enhanced, and sustainable access and recreation facilitated.

It is noted that the Nant Fawr in this area is not located on the application site, but on adjacent land owned by Welsh Water, and enclosed from the application site by a 2m high palisade fence, It is also noted that the Nant Fawr in this area is canalised where it parallels the reservoir, and additionally culverted where it parallels the application site boundary. Improvements to access in this location

are therefore not within the applicant's gift, nor is the current access permitted by Welsh Water compromised in any way by the development of the rugby pitch.

It is concluded that the development, subject to appropriate boundary treatment and landscape buffer to the northern and eastern perimeter of the site will have a neutral impact on the character of the River corridor in this location.

The comments of NRW are also noted in respect of ensuring that no unauthorised access to the woodland and reservoirs is achieved through opening up relevant boundary enclosures, this can be achieved by condition

# 8.22 TREES, WOODLANDS AND HEDGEROWS

LDP policy KP16 indicates that the protection and conservation of natural heritage network needs to be reconciled with the benefits of development proposed; and that development should therefore demonstrate how green infrastructure has been considered and integrated into the proposals.

Policy EN8 states that Development will not be permitted that would cause unacceptable harm to trees, woodlands and hedgerows of significant public amenity, natural or cultural heritage value, or that contribute significantly to mitigating the effects of climate change.

8.23 Submitted Layout revision 'E' indicates that the development would only require the felling of two trees (T1 and T2) within the application site. Both are located at the NW corner of the pitch, and reported as being Category 'C' trees (Low quality and value) which are in poor physical and structural condition. The loss of these trees is regrettable, but replacement planting is proposed and would have more potential to be effectively managed and enjoy greater longevity that those specimens to be removed. On this basis the tree loss is accepted.

All trees to the N of the application site are considered to be of high quality and value (Category A trees). These trees are protected by a Tree Preservation Order. All trees to the E of the application site are categorised as being of moderate quality and value (Category B trees) but are not of protected status; - In any event all of these trees to be retained, with recommendations relating only to Ivy removal, coppicing of the existing understorey of trees; and minimal interventions including the removal of deadwood..

8.24 In terms of potential overshadowing, and consequent amenity implications, the revised layout E seeks to position houses and garages which are parallel to the Eastern Boundary in a manner which will reduce the impact of shadow fall of trees to areas affecting garages as opposed to principal garden areas or properties for most of the day and this is considered appropriate.

The development proposals in themselves are therefore concluded not to present any adverse implications for trees.

However the comments of the Council's Tree Officer are noted in respect of the potential to receive future applications for the removal of overhanging branches; and his disappointment that the applicant has elected not to provide an ecotone to effect a smoother transition between residential gardens and unmanaged woodland.

In respect of the trees to the north, the trees are protected by Tree Preservation Orders and any proposals for lopping or crown lifting will fall to be considered under those protection arrangements.

In respect of the trees to the east of the site however, it is acknowledged that works to these trees are less able to be controlled, as the trees are not protected by a TPO; or located in a conservation area which would require notification to the local authority of any proposals to fell or lop or prune.

8.25 The retention of these trees as proposed within the application submission, is welcomed, and can be protected by condition for the duration of any construction works, and potentially for a limited time thereafter as part of a 'retained' landscaping condition (Normally 5 years). However Planning Committee should be aware that the ultimate future longevity of the trees would effectively be within the hands of the home owners if planning permission were to be approved.

The absence of an ecotone to northern woodland, is disappointing, but the presence of a sewer located within the application site, approximately 4m from the woodland boundary is accepted as limiting the capacity for any large scale planting within that area.

The applicant was however asked to enlarge the area between the proposed housing development and the outer canopy of trees in the woodland, but has not done so substantially. The applicant instead has proposed a woodland buffer of between 1-2m width between the rear boundary enclosure of the site and gardens to the north, and the eastern boundary parallel to Llanishen reservoir.

Practically this may better serve reptiles or grass snakes to the east, and may provide some scrub protection to the north. However the planning officer shares the concerns of the Council's tree officer that the very limited buffer proposed, is more likely to represent a maintenance nuisance, than be of any practical benefit and most likely would be adopted into the garden areas of the dwellings proposed.

As proposed, the amended Layout provides for an estimated distance of approximately 6m minimum distance from existing canopies to the rear of the proposed dwellings to the north, and slightly greater distances between the canopies of trees and the residential properties to the east.

8.26 The layout arrangement is therefore concluded to be far from ideal, but unlikely to be sustainable as a reason for the refusal of planning permission if tested at appeal, as the trees to the east are not considered of sufficient amenity value to

be protected, and because the development in itself would not harm the trees in the woodland to the north.

As this is the case it is considered appropriate to safeguard the health and longevity of the trees within the designated woodland to the north, by using planning powers to remove otherwise 'permitted development rights' for structures and pools as may be proposed within domestic garden curtilages, under the canopy spreads of the trees. This would not realise an absolute response to such proposals, but would require the approval of planning permission for such structures in order that their impact and design can be assessed.

# 8.26 ECOLOGICAL NETWORKS AND FEATURES OF IMPORTANCE FOR BIODIVERSITY / DESIGNATED SITES

LDP Policies EN5 and EN6 indicates that Development will only be permitted if it does not cause unacceptable harm to landscape features of importance for wild flora and fauna, including wildlife corridors and 'stepping stones' which enable the dispersal and functioning of protected and priority species or Networks of importance for landscape or nature conservation.

The policy text continues: Particular priority will be given to the protection, enlargement, connectivity and management of the overall nature of semi natural habitats. Where this is not the case and the need for the development outweighs the nature conservation importance of the site, it should be demonstrated that there is no satisfactory alternative location for the development and compensatory provision will be made of comparable ecological value to that lost as a result of the development.

The site itself is confirmed as having very low to no ecological value, neither does it have any designated status. The hard surfaced car park and manicured and flat open nature of the Rugby pitch make it unavailable for flora, and uninviting for mammals which would be vulnerable to predators on such an exposed landscape.

The adjacent SINC in the Gwern y bendy wood; and Reservoir SINC of grassland scrub environment appropriate for Grass Snakes and Glow worms to the East of the application site boundary are both located outside of the application site, and although such designated boundaries are somewhat artificial, the planning officer notes that they are also manifested on the ground by physical fences.

The development is therefore concluded to have little impact on the biodiversity interests of the surrounding land which exist despite the pitch rather than it being critical to their interests.

The comments of NRW are noted in respect of the restriction of access to adjacent designated sites for fear of damage to fungi on the adjacent SSSI. The planning officer notes that these are in the ownership of other parties and therefore access to those sites would in any event need to be agreed with the

owners. However a planning condition to prevent the establishment of means of access to adjacent land can be controlled by condition.

## 8.27 Community Facilities

Policies C1 and C2 of the LDP seek to provide and protect new and existing community facilities; and in isolation this application would require the provision of a community facility or a contribution toward Community facilities provision in the area in line with the Council's SPG.

The comments of the Regeneration Officer are noted as is the requested financial contribution of £29,007.

However if acceptable in all other respects, the Planning Officer considers that if the proposed 3G pitch and changing rooms offered by the applicant were to be provided at Llanishen High School, that it is appropriate to weigh this provision against this policy requirement.

As the compensatory facility would be accessible by a much larger cross section of the community than the private members pitch, this is considered acceptable, and members are advised that it is considered to waive the financial contribution in this instance subject to the delivery of the pitch and changing rooms.

#### 8.28 Contaminated and Unstable Land

The Pollution Control Officer has not made any request for site survey in respect of contamination, and has suggested conditions only relating to the management of any unexpected contamination. Given the developed nature of the land as a sports pitch this is understandable. However the applicant should satisfy themselves as to the likelihood of any contamination on the land. Standard conditions can be applied to any resolution to grant planning permission in respect of the discovery of any unexpected contamination.

Further conditions can be applied to control the quality of any imported materials necessary to construct/ landscape the development.

## 8.29 Provision for Waste Management Facilities in Development

LDP Policy W2 seeks to ensure the provision of appropriate waste management facilities in development. All of the development plots are considered capable of accommodating adequate refuse storage.

The waste manager has raised no objection to the development subject to satisfactory bin store positioning, highway layout and materials being agreed to allow proper access by refuse vehicles. This can be achieved by condition.

## 8.30 Affordable Housing

Policy KP13: responding to evidenced social needs, Indicates that a key part of the successful progression of the city will be to develop sustainable neighbourhoods, tackle deprivation, and improve the quality of life for all; and that this will be achieved through providing a range of dwelling size, type and affordability (including seeking to provide a target of 6,646 affordable dwellings over the remaining life of the development plan period).

Policy H3 of the LDP indicates that the Council will seek 20% affordable housing provision on Brownfield sites of 5 or more dwellings and that affordable housing will be sought to be delivered on-site in all instances unless there are exceptional circumstances.

The provision of 3 two bed houses; 1 three bed house; and 1 four bed house for transfer to a Registered Social Landlord for low cost rental tenure in perpetuity accords with LDP policy and is acceptable to the housing manager.

The Planning Officer concurs with on-site provision, and would seek to ensure for a matching finish to the buildings in line with the market housing stock.

This can be secured by condition.

A Housing Association (RSL) will be required to purchase and manage the affordable housing stock at currently agreed transfer rates.

## 8.31 Other Matters raised in Representations

- Invasion of Landscape Buffer of the Reservoirs
   The trees adjacent to reservoir land are not within the application site
- Proximity and relationship of affordable housing on Rheidol Close
   The position of these units has been amended to further offset their proximity and impact.
- Construction nuisance

The development of the land is acknowledged to be disruptive, but no more so than any other development project. The development can be controlled by means of a construction management condition and will fall within the statutory provisions of the Pollution Control Act in respect of the duration of construction activities.

• Proximity and relationship of dwellings to 43 Usk Road The position of these units has been amended and the original relationship, which was also unacceptable to the planning officer has been revised. The proposed relationship now places the new buildings some 13m away from the existing residence at an acute angle, forward of the building line of the property, A bedroom window would be positioned within the rear elevation which would offer sight of the rear garden of 43 Usk Road but would realise a relationship not dissimilar to the overlooking of gardens by neighbours in properties sharing a common rear building line. This is considered an acceptable relationship.

- Clustering of Affordable Housing
   Given the very limited number of units proposed (5) there would be no
   rationale to disperse them around the site and more logic in combining
   them as semi-detached or terraced units.
- Loss of Privacy and overlooking (21 Usk Road)
  Plot 1 overlooks a substation to the rear of 21 Usk Road at a distance of some 18m from the opposite side of the Usk Grove Carriageway. Plot 22 would overlook the side elevation of 21 Usk Road at a distance of 16m at an acute angle and again from the opposite side of the Usk Road Carriageway. This is considered acceptable as neither building directly faces the existing house or its garden.
- Loss of a Natural Heritage Asset Not concurred with.
- Reduction in the quality of life of Local Residents
  There is no reason to suggest that the development of the site would reduce the quality of life of existing occupiers. Other than to more intensively utilise a piece of land which is currently vacant for a large proportion of the time. The development very similar to that existing at Usk Grove which is high quality low density development and which in no way would constitute an incompatible or conflicting use.
- No overriding need for housing on this site given the strategic allocations confirmed by the LDP
   The pursuance of a 5 year housing land supply is a constantly changing dynamic and the allocation of strategic housing sites within the LDP does not preclude the development of land for residential purposes outside of those areas provided that such developments accord with planning policy.
- Lack of obligation to provide the 3G pitch at Llanishen High School as a compensatory community facility.
   This will need to be guaranteed by legal undertaking/contract with the Council to make the development acceptable in planning policy terms, but this is quite possible and usual.
- Inability to maintain Wildlife Margins / Potential for fly tipping
   No wildlife margins have been requested within the application site, but
   may be a consequence of the buffers proposed to soften the edges of
   the development aesthetically. Issues of fly tipping or deposit of items
   including garden waste over garden fences can be problematic, but
   there is nothing to suggest that residents of the proposed houses would
   be minded to undertake such activities if appropriate garden waste
   collections are implemented.

Cumulative impact on Highway network with Churchlands development.
The cumulative impact of an additional twenty five houses in combination with a proportion of traffic from the proposed Churchlands development is not considered likely to have any significant effect on traffic flows on the Fidlas Road Carraigeway.

The traffic impact of the proposal in isolation is considered acceptable and addressed within the report.

# 9.0 Section 106 / Legal Matters

In order to achieve policy compliance, the applicant or relevant interested parties are required to:

- Provide the 5 affordable housing units of for purchase by a Registered Social Landlord at agreed transfer fee for low cost rental tenure.
- Make a financial contribution of £64,752 toward the provision, maintenance or enhancement of existing Public Open Space in the locality.
- To Make a financial contribution toward the provision of a bus shelter and highway build-out at the bus stop near the junction of Usk Road and Fidlas road, and such modification of traffic orders at the junction of Usk Road and Fidlas Road, and the junction of Ewenny Road and Fidlas Road as may be deemed appropriate by the Local Highway Authority, to a maximum sum of £40,000 [or] to provide such facilities to the approval of the Local Highway Authority prior to first occupation of any dwelling hereby approved.

The loss of open space resulting from the development necessitates a requirement for compensatory provision in accordance with approved Planning Policy and Supplementary Planning Guidance.

It is confirmed to Planning Committee that the provision of a 3G pitch and changing room facility offered by the land owner and as now approved by planning permission 16/01209/MJR is considered an acceptable compensatory provision from a planning perspective.

The Council's Legal Officers confirm that if members of planning committee are minded to grant permission for the housing development at Usk Road then the delivery of the pitch and changing room facilities at Llanishen High school will need to be guaranteed by means of a binding legal undertaking.

Such guarantee may be in the form of a legal agreement under S106 of the Town and Country Planning Act; or could be secured by alternative contractual means or undertakings outside of planning provisions.

The precise mechanism for securing the facility is a matter for the applicant and the Council's lawyers, but members are asked to consider the development applied for here, on the basis of such provision.

# Recommendation

That subject to the guarantee of the provision of a 3G pitch and changing room as approved by planning permission 16/01209/MJR; and such other obligations as detailed at Section 9 of this report, that Planning Permission be Granted.

